



ELSEVIER

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

## Automatica

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/automatica](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/automatica)

## Correspondence

**Reply to “Comments on ‘Mittag-Leffler stability of fractional order nonlinear dynamic systems’ [Automatica 45(8) (2009) 1965–1969]”<sup>☆</sup>**



Li, Y., Chen, Y. Q., & Podlubny, I. (2009). Mittag-Leffler stability of fractional order nonlinear dynamic systems. *Automatica*, 45(8), 1965–1969.

It was stated in Naifar, Makhoulf, and Hammami (2017) that “However, the negative sign of  ${}_0^C D_t^\beta V(t, x(t))$  does not imply the monotonicity of  $V(t, x(t))$ ,  $\dots$ . Hence, monotonic decay of  $V(t, x(t))$  does not follow from Lemma 10  $\dots$ ”.

It has been obvious that the negative sign of  ${}_0^C D_t^\beta V(t, x(t))$ , where  $\beta \in (0, 1)$ , does not imply the monotonicity of  $V(t, x(t))$ . In the proof of Theorem 11 in Li, Chen, and Podlubny (2009), the boundedness of  $V(t, x(t))$  was proved by using Lemma 10, i.e.  $V(t, x(t)) \leq V(0, x(0))$ . The monotonicity of  $V(t, x(t))$  was not used.

The results in Li et al. (2009) are correct. More generalization is possible when smoothness condition changes.

## References

Naifar, O., Makhoulf, A. B., & Hammami, M. A. (2017). Comments on Mittag-Leffler stability of fractional order nonlinear dynamic systems. *Automatica*, 75, 329.

Yan Li

School of Control Science and Engineering, Shandong University,  
Jinan 250061, Shandong, PR China  
E-mail address: [liyan.sdu@gmail.com](mailto:liyan.sdu@gmail.com).

YangQuan Chen

Department of Mechanical Engineering, School of Engineering,  
University of California, Merced 5200 North Lake Road, Merced, CA  
95343, USA  
E-mail address: [ychen53@ucmerced.edu](mailto:ychen53@ucmerced.edu).

Igor Podlubny

BERG Faculty, Technical University of Kosice, B. Nemcovej 3, 04200  
Kosice, Slovakia  
E-mail address: [igor.podlubny@tuke.sk](mailto:igor.podlubny@tuke.sk).

12 July 2016

Available online 17 November 2016

DOI of original article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.automatica.2009.04.003>.

<sup>☆</sup> The material in this paper was not presented at any conference. This paper was recommended for publication in revised form by Editor André L. Tits.